

Peace Studies Senior Seminar

International Mediation

Fall 2020

IIPS 43101

MW 9:35-10:50

Instructor: Laurie Nathan (lnathan@nd.edu), Jenkins Nanovic Halls B032

Office hours: Meetings will be by appointment and via Zoom

1. COVID-19

In light of the COVID-19 crisis and the challenges this poses for teaching, we will follow the principles of collective patience, empathy, pragmatism, support, flexibility and creativity!

The Course will be a mixture of in-person and Zoom seminars. The simulation exercises and the presentation of the students' draft research papers will take via Zoom and all the other seminars will be in-person (see Section 7 below).

Students will be expected to adhere to University rules regarding safe health practices.

2. Overview of Seminar

This Senior Seminar explores international mediation, defined as a process whereby a third party assists parties in conflict, with their consent, to reach agreements they find acceptable and are willing to implement. International mediation has been widely practiced for many decades, particularly since the end of the Cold War. There are few major intra- or inter-state conflicts in the contemporary era that have not been subject to mediation by the United Nations (UN), a regional organization or a state.

The stakes of mediation are very high in deadly conflicts: success or failure determines whether the country remains locked in strife or is able to embark on a path of reconciliation and reconstruction. In the case of Rwanda, for example, the peace agreement mediated by Tanzania in 1992-3 broke down and was overwhelmed by the genocide. In Kenya, by contrast, the 2008 mediation led by Kofi Annan on behalf of the African Union prevented a descent into protracted violence. In Syria, mediation has failed to stem the killing of thousands of civilians and the destruction of large parts of the country.

Where mediation in civil wars is successful, the peace agreement has a major bearing on justice, security, governance and the risk of violence in the post-war society. Mediation and negotiations are thus the bridge, sometimes tenuous and sometimes robust, between war termination and long-term peacebuilding, statebuilding and conflict transformation.

3. Literature

There is a rich academic literature on international mediation. It includes single volumes, edited volumes and journals such as the *Journal of Peace Research*, the *Journal of Conflict Resolution* and *Negotiation Journal*. It encompasses reviews of the scholarly debates (e.g. Kleiboer 1996; Wallensteen & Svensson 2014); comparative studies on specific themes, such as co-ordination among different mediators (e.g. Lanz & Gasser 2013); theories on particular problems, like the

ripeness of a conflict for resolution through negotiations (e.g. Zartman 2001); case studies of particular mediation initiatives (e.g. Menkhaus 1996); and quantitative studies seeking to ascertain the relationship between specified variables and the outcome of mediation (see Wallensteen & Svensson 2014). In addition to the academic literature, there is a large policy literature that seeks to identify lessons from prior mediation experiences (e.g. UN Secretary-General 2012; Brahim & Ahmed 2008).

References for the Seminar readings are attached as Appendix 1. All the readings will be available on Sakai.

4. Seminar Purpose, Focus and Learning Outcomes

The purpose of this Senior Seminar is to give students an opportunity to synthesize and integrate what they have learned in their Peace Studies courses into an understanding of international mediation.

The Seminar will cover the following: the scholarly and policy literature on mediation; mediation case studies; simulation exercises on the skills of conflict analysis and strategic planning for mediation; and a research paper prepared by each student. Throughout the Seminar, I will integrate insights from my practitioner experience as a mediator.

Upon successful completion of the Seminar, you will be able to:

- Describe and analyze critically key debates and theories in the academic and policy literature on international mediation.
- Identify the factors that determine the success and failure of international mediation.
- Explain the complexity and difficulty of international mediation.
- Analyze cases of international mediation in high intensity conflicts.
- Apply the skills of conflict analysis, strategizing and process design for peacemaking.
- Integrate knowledge from your previous Peace Studies courses into a holistic understanding of international mediation.
- Write a research paper that analyzes mediation in a high intensity conflict and makes recommendations to improve the mediation.

In addition to the focus on international mediation, you will strengthen the following general academic skills:

- Reading, synthesizing and reviewing academic and policy literature in a critical way.
- Writing clearly and logically.
- Grounding arguments in evidence.
- Making clear oral presentations based on evidence and relevant literature.

Class activities are designed to help you achieve these learning outcomes and prepare you for the assignments described below.

5. Assignments

There will be four types of assignment:

- Class participation (20%). This will be based on your active participation in class and your familiarity with the Seminar readings (Appendix 1). You must become familiar with the designated readings for each class *prior to that class*. The readings will be presented by

the students and I will ask you for your views on these readings during the class. Class attendance is compulsory. Marks will be deducted for more than two unexcused absences (as defined in University policy).

- Insights from practice papers (20%). You will write two ‘insights from practice’ papers (5-7 pages max) after each of the two simulation exercises. The papers will describe and explain what you learnt from the exercise, highlight your most interesting insights, and integrate 3-4 of the Seminar readings.
- Research paper (40%). You will write a 15-20 page paper that analyzes mediation in a conflict of your choice and makes recommendations to improve the mediation. The paper will integrate readings and discussions from the Seminar as well as from other courses you have taken. I will distribute a rubric for this paper.
- Class presentation (20%). Prior to the submission of your research paper, you will present a draft version of the paper in class. Students will provide feedback. The final paper should have an appendix indicating how you addressed this feedback.

All assignments must be submitted via Sakai. I will provide written feedback on each assignment, as well as general feedback in class. A rubric for marking the assignments will be added to this syllabus.

In all the assignments, the quality of your writing is very important. Poor writing inhibits understanding of your ideas and arguments. You are therefore encouraged to give your draft papers to another student for feedback and proofreading before submitting them to me.

6. Academic Code of Honor

You must comply with the Academic Code of Honor (<http://www.nd.edu/~hnr/code/docs/handbook.htm>). Note that “as a general rule, tests and other assessments should reflect a student’s own effort unless otherwise approved by course instructors”. Class attendance is compulsory but flexibility on the nature of that attendance is possible in light of the COVID-19 circumstances.

7. Schedule

Aug 10 Introduction to the Seminar

Introduction to the Seminar; introduction to international mediation

Readings: Greig & Diehl (2012), chs. 1 & 2; Zartman & Touval (2007); UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Definitions and Categories of UN Peace Interventions

Aug 12 Introduction to the scholarly literature

Factors accounting for mediation success and failure; mediation debates and state of knowledge

Readings: Kleiboer (1996); Wallensteen & Svensson (2014)

Aug 17 Introduction to the policy literature

Policy perspectives on mediation

Readings: Brahimi & Ahmed (2008); UN Secretary-General (2012)

- Aug 19** **Discussion on students' research paper**
Expectations regarding research paper assignment
- Aug 24** **Theoretical framework for peacemaking: Ripeness theory**
Zartman's theory of conflict ripeness
Reading: Zartman (2001)
- Aug 26** **Application of ripeness theory**
Application of ripeness to the Darfur mediation
Reading: Nathan (2006)
- Aug 31** **Theoretical framework for peacemaking: Positive and negative peace**
Galtung's theory of structural violence; concept of 'positions, interests & needs'
Readings: Galtung (1969); UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Positions, Interests and Needs
- Sept 2** **Preventive diplomacy**
State of knowledge
Readings: Lund (2009); Ackerman (2003); UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Preventive Diplomacy by the UN
- Sept 7** **Preventive diplomacy contd.**
International and domestic preventive diplomacy: Lebanon & Nigeria
Readings: Nathan, Day, Honwana & Brubaker (2018), Policy Paper, pp. 4-24 and Lebanon & Nigeria cases
- Sept 9** **Simulation exercise: Conflict analysis for peacemaking**
Simulation exercise
Readings: Phase 1, simulation case study; UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Conflict Analysis and Ripeness for Mediation
- Sept 14** **Simulation exercise: Conflict analysis for peacemaking contd.**
- Sept 16** **Mediation mandates**
Conceptualization and typology of mandates
Readings: Nathan (2018); Svensson & Wallensteen (2010), chs. 1&8
- Sept 21** **Mediation mandates contd.**
The UN mandate for Yemen
Reading: Forster (2017)
- Sept 23** **Mediation strategy and style**
Pros and cons of leverage
Readings: Beardsley (2013); Zartman & Touval (2007)
- Sept 28** **Mediation strategy and style contd.**
Case exploration of mediation styles: Northern Ireland & Bosnia–Herzegovina
Reading: Curran, Sebenius & Watkins (2004)

- Sept 30** **To be determined**
The topic of this class will be determined in consultation with the students
- Oct 5** **Simulation exercise: Strategic planning and process design for peacemaking**
Simulation exercise
Readings: Phase 2, simulation case study; UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Developing a UN Mediation Strategy and Briefing Note on Mediation Process Design
- Oct 7** **Simulation exercise: Strategic planning and process design for peacemaking contd.**
Simulation exercise
Readings: Phase 2, simulation case study; UNHLMC (2019), Briefing Note on Developing a UN Mediation Strategy and Briefing Note on Mediation Process Design
- Oct 12** **International actors**
Challenges of cooperation and coordination among mediation actors
Readings: Lanz & Gasser (2013); Nathan (2017)
- Oct 14** **Civil society inclusion**
Civil society participation in mediated negotiations
Readings: Paffenholz (2014); Akol (2014); Pring (2017)
- Oct 19** **Gender challenges**
Gender inclusion and other imperatives
Reading: Bell (2013)
- Oct 21** **Cultural challenges**
How does / should culture matter in mediation?
Readings: Menkhaus (1996); Salem (1993)
- Oct 26** **Challenges of law and justice**
The dilemma of peace versus justice
Reading: Hayner (2018), chs. 1&2
- Oct 28** **Presentation of draft research papers**
- Nov 2** **Presentation of draft research papers**
- Nov 4** **Presentation of draft research papers**
- Nov 9** **Presentation of draft research papers**
- Nov 11** **Consolidation**

Required Readings

- Ackermann, A. 2003. "The Idea and Practice of Conflict Prevention", *Journal of Peace Research* 40(3): 339-347.
- Akol, Z. 2014. "Inclusivity: A Challenge to the IGAD-Led South Sudanese Peace Process", *Policy Brief*, The Sudd Institute, 7 December.
- Beardsley, K. 2013. "Using the Right Tool for the Job: Mediator Leverage and Conflict Resolution", *Penn State Journal of Law and International Affairs* 2(1): 57-65.
- Bell, C. 2013. "Women and Peace Processes, Negotiations, and Agreements: Operational Opportunities and Challenges", *NOREF Policy Brief*.
- Brahimi, L. and S. Ahmed. 2008. *In Pursuit of Sustainable Peace: The Seven Deadly Sins of Mediation*, Center on International Cooperation, New York University.
- Curran, D., J. Sebenius and M. Watkins. 2004. "Two Paths to Peace: Contrasting George Mitchell in Northern Ireland with Richard Holbrooke in Bosnia–Herzegovina", *Negotiation Journal* 20(4): 513-537.
- Forster, R. 2017. "Toward a Comprehensive Solution? Yemen's Two-Year Peace Process", *The Middle East Journal* 71(3): 479-488.
- Galtung, J. 1969. "Violence, Peace, and Peace Research", *Journal of Peace Research* 6(3): 167-191.
- Greig, M. and P. Diehl. 2012. *International Mediation*, Cambridge, UK: Polity.
- Hayner, P. 2018. *The Peacemaker's Paradox: Pursuing Justice in the Shadow of Conflict*. New York: Routledge.
- Kleiboer, M. 1996. "Understanding Success and Failure of International Mediation", *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 40(2): 360-389.
- Lanz, D. and R. Gasser. 2013. "A Crowded Field: Competition and Coordination in International Peace Mediation", *Mediation Arguments* 2, Centre for Mediation in Africa.
- Lund, M. 2009. "Conflict Prevention: Theory in Pursuit of Policy and Practice", in J. Bercovitch, V. Kremenyuk, and I. W. Zartman (eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Conflict Resolution*, London: Sage, pp. 287-308.
- Menkhaus, K. 1996. "International Peacebuilding and the Dynamics of Local and National Reconciliation in Somalia", *International Peacekeeping* 3(1): 42-67.
- Nathan, L. 2006. "No Ownership, No Peace: The Darfur Peace Agreement", *Working Paper* 2(5), Crisis States Research Centre, London School of Economics.

Nathan, L. 2017. "How to Manage Inter-Organizational Disputes over Mediation in Africa", *Global Governance* 23(2): 151-162.

Nathan, L. 2018. "The Mandate Effect: A Typology and Conceptualization of Mediation Mandates", *Peace & Change* 43(3): 318-343.

Nathan, L., A. Day, J. Honwana and R. Brubaker. 2018. *Capturing UN Preventive Diplomacy Success: How and Why Does It Work?*, Centre for Policy Research, UN University.

Paffenholz, T. 2014. "Broadening Participation in Peace Processes: Dilemmas and Options for Mediators", *Mediation Practice Series*, Center for Humanitarian Dialogue.

Pring, J. 2017. "Including or Excluding Civil Society? The Role of the Mediation Mandate in South Sudan (2013-15) and Zimbabwe (2008-9)", *African Security* 10(3&4): 223-238.

Reid, L. 2017. "Finding a Peace That Lasts: Mediator Leverage and the Durable Resolution of Civil Wars". *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 61(7): 1401-1431.

Salem, P. 1993. "A Critique of Western Conflict Resolution from a Non-Western Perspective", *Negotiation Journal* 9(4): 361-369.

Svensson, I. and P. Wallensteen. 2010. *The Go-Between: Jan Eliasson and the Styles of Mediation*, Washington DC: US Institute of Peace.

UN High Level Mediation Course (UNHLMC) manual, 2019.

UN Secretary-General. 2012. *Guidance for Effective Mediation*, New York: United Nations.

Wallensteen, P. and I. Svensson. 2014. "Talking Peace: International Mediation in Armed Conflicts", *Journal of Peace Research* 51(2): 315-327.

Zartman, I.W. 2001. "The Timing of Peace Initiatives: Hurting Stalemates and Ripe Moments", *The Global Review of Ethnopolitics* 1(1): 8-18.

Zartman, I. and S. Touval. 2007. "International Mediation", in C. Crocker, F. Hampson and P. Aall (eds), *Leashing the Dogs of War: Conflict Management in a Divided World*, Washington DC: US Institute for Peace, pp. 437-454.